

December 3, 2012

To the United States Senate:

The undersigned organizations object to the insertion of a declaration into the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities that purports to set current U.S. law as the limit of its obligations under the treaty.¹

That declaration states:

The Senate declares that, in view of the reservations to be included in the instrument of ratification, current United States law fulfills or exceeds the obligations of the Convention for the United States.

The reservations referenced in the declaration address federalism, private conduct and obligations concerning torture and ill treatment.

The federalism reservation states:

Federalism. To the extent that state and local governments exercise jurisdiction over issues covered by the convention, U.S. obligations under the convention are limited to the U.S. government taking measures appropriate to the federal system, such as enforcement under the ADA, with the ultimate objective of full implementation.

This reservation is one of process rather than substance. It acknowledges and accepts the CRPD standards while limiting U.S. obligations to those that the federal government can undertake.

The declaration that "current U.S. law fulfills or exceeds the obligations of the Convention" on the other hand is one of substance. While it may, by incorporating the federalism reservation, admit that state laws may not comply with the standards, it appears to disavow the obligation to take measures appropriate to the federal system with the objective of full implementation.

Furthermore, by asserting broadly that both federal and state law fulfill CRPD obligations, the declaration claims that any actions taken to improve those laws

¹ In addition to the declaration discussed in the letter, we object to the understanding on Article 7 of the CRPD that specifically exempts the U.S. from changing its laws to comply with standards on the rights of children with disabilities, and to the understanding on the definitions of "reasonable accommodation" and "discrimination based on disability" which set U.S. law above core standards of the treaty. We do not agree with the other reservations, understandings or declarations, which all purport to limit U.S. obligations in ways that adversely impact the rights of persons with disabilities. We choose to address the most damaging declaration in this letter in the hope that it will permit a more focused discussion.

would be a matter of political choice rather than legal obligation to comply with CRPD.

We are aware that the United States has consistently taken the position that it only ratifies treaties with which it considers itself to be already in compliance. However, if the ratification of CRPD goes through with this declaration, it would be the first time that such a position was made a formal part of the ratification instrument. In setting domestic law as a whole above the standards of the treaty, this declaration would amount to a reservation incompatible with the treaty's object and purpose, impermissible under international law.² Similar reservations and declarations have met with objections from other states parties to the CRPD³ and from legal experts.⁴

Ratifying a treaty means agreeing to uphold its standards, and not unilaterally making a blanket determination that a country's own law "fulfills or exceeds" those standards.

We urge the Senate to remove the declaration complained of, to modify its understandings accordingly on the rights of children with disabilities and the definitions of discrimination and reasonable accommodation, and to ratify the CRPD with the intention and objective of full implementation. If you have questions or require further information, please contact Tina Minkowitz, info@chrusp.org, telephone number 518-494-0174.

Sincerely,

The undersigned organizations and individuals, see following page

² Under customary international law, as codified by the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties,

"reservation" means a unilateral statement, however phrased or named, made by a State, when signing, ratifying, accepting, approving or acceding to a treaty, whereby it purports to exclude or to modify the legal effect of certain provisions of the treaty in their application to that State.

³ See <http://www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?id=475>.

⁴ See Legal Opinion on Article 12 of the CRPD, June 21, 2008, signed by 31 legal experts from 15 countries, http://www.leeds.ac.uk/disability-studies/archiveuk/legal%20opinion/LegalOpinion_Art12_FINAL.pdf.

Center for the Human Rights of Users and
Survivors of Psychiatry
Voices of the Heart, Inc.
Law Project for Psychiatric Rights
Intentional Peer Support
IMPAC – Ithaca Mental Patients Advocacy
Coalition
Mental Health Empowerment Project
Youth Power!
US Human Rights Network
The Opal Project
Will Hall, MA, DiplPW
Portland Hearing Voices
Madness Radio
Communities United Against Police Brutality
Another Way Inc.
Marjorie Cohn, Professor of Law, Thomas
Jefferson School of Law
Mary Bricker-Jenkins, PhD, Professor
Emeritus, Temple University
David Wagner, University of Southern Maine
Arise for Social Justice
Suzanne Jasper, First Peoples Human Rights
Coalition
William P Quigley, Professor of Law, Loyola
University New Orleans
Marykate Connor, Executive Director,
Caduceus Justice
Davidson/Site 166 Resident Association Inc of
the New York City Housing Authority
Social Justice Center of Marin Treaties Task
Force
The Woodhull Sexual Freedom Alliance, Ricci
Joy Levy, Executive Director
Mental Patients Liberation Alliance
CAFETY
Shae Wilson
Roe Royal
Marie Parcell
Terrie Frye
Vermont Workers Center
Center for Constitutional Rights
Midwest Coalition for Human Rights
Paula J Caplan
Andrea Parra
Maria Teresa Fernandez
Grassroots Group to End Harm from
Psychiatric Diagnosis

Baltic Street AEH Inc.
Duane Sherry
Stephen G. Boren
Duane Haataja
Judah Snyder
Tim Nolan
Jim Keiser
Tina Aye
Bernadette Bushe
Louise Gordon
Maxine Hayden
Shae Leggett
Eve Remba
Sarah Knutson
John F. Prior
Bob Bennett
Kris P. Dink
Laura Ziegler
Relatives & Allies of Psychiatric Survivors
Susan Roberts
Carole F. Hayes Collier, MPA
Erick Fabris
Jennifer Marie Hughes
Pamela Thorn
Toni Jo Silvey
Maxwell Wolf
Charmaine Asher
Mary Maddock
Cindi Fisher
The M.O.M.S. movement at
MentalHealthRightsYES.org
George Ebert
Amalia Jurj
Shain Neumeier
Fred Arthur Tenzer
Molly Graver
Jean Cozens
Cody Seth Crawford
Charlie Bombalier
Anthony Ciccarino
Gail Penney
Gerald McVeigh
West Coast Mental Health Network
Valeria Jones
Lauren Tenney
Mike Bachhuber
Bryhre Cormack CCC
Carol Moore

Madeline Klein
Rebecca Skalinder
Kirsten Oliver
Tina Bonneau
Becky Murphy
Kathryn Cascio
Brenda LeFrancois
Eileen McGinn
Graeme Bacque
Bonnie Nelson
Julia Baber
Shannon Teresa Bogdanich
Delores M. Jankovich
Erik JM Schneider
Anna Golinska
Evelyn Stewart
John Tovey
Gerald Otis
Pamela Molina
Rosita Libre de Marulanda
Sheri Eva Lorraine Culver
Kevin Jackson
Chrys Muirhead
Emilia Abeyta
Cynthia Bage
Dorrit Cato Christensen
Daniel Hazen
Wind Vogel
Elizabeth E Metcalf
Laura Ann K Bernstein
Dee Jacobson
Susan Wiseheart
Clifford Harbin
Steven Periard
Frank Blankenship
Bridgette Searles
Eric Whalen
Michael Dittmer
Tanya Temkin
Rita Di Carlo
Dorothy Dundas
Bernard P. Daniels
Thomas R. Brown
Robert Olcott
Ann G. Burgess, CSCS, CPS
Phillip Marc Fabre
Tina Minkowitz
Loïse Forest

Michal Prokop Caletka
Adinah Caro-Greene
Beth Filson
Anne Weaver, M.A., LMHC
The AntiPsychiatry Movement
Cynthia Rossetti
Amy Smith
Diane Engster, J.D.
April Fawn Scheller
Louise Tam
Ron Schraiber
Brigianna Spencer
Jennifer Marie Hughes
Kelly Mooney
Naomi Pinson
Sonia Linkfield
Dan A. Goldstein
Michael Case
Starla Scouden
Sylvia Dawson
Mylene Berkowitz
Natalie Patrice Tucker
María Magdalena Orlando, Master on
Inclusion, Univ. of Salamanca
Facundo Chavez Penillas, Human Rights &
Disability Lawyer
Laura Delano
Muhannad Alazzeah
Sonia Weaver
Piers Gooding
Jolijn Santegoeds
Thilo Kroll
Dannis
Martina Orsander
Barbara Watson
Kathleen Bock
Grace Heckenberg
David Matthew Gofton
Fiona O'Riordan
Elizabeth Martin
Mari Yamamoto
Sharon L. Snyder
Shelley Heath
Patrick Risser
Alain E. Weaver
Krista Johnson